Application of Bradford's Law on journal citations: A study of Ph.D. theses in social sciences of University of Delhi

K P Singh^a and Bebi^b

^aSenior Assistant Professor and Principal Investigator, Department of Library and Information Science, University of Delhi, Delhi, Email: singhkp_1972@yahoo.co.in.

^bPh.D. Research Scholar, Department of Library and Information Science, University of Delhi, Delhi, Email: bebi.mywork@gmail.com

Received: 10 January 2014; revised: 20 May 2014; accepted: 03 June 2014

The study covers 260 Ph.D. theses submitted during 1995-2008 that have a total of 9,997 references scattered in 934 journals. The study found that the journal *Economic & Political Weekly* is the most cited journal with 22.8% citations, followed by *The Punjab Past and Present* with 1.80% citations. Bradford's law of scattering fits to the present study.

Keywords: Bradford's Law of Scattering; Social Science literature; Core journals; Journals citations; University of Delhi

Introduction

Journals are a key information source to the researchers. However, the large number of journals and their high subscription costs make it difficult for libraries to subscribe all required journals. Citation analysis can be carried out to identify core journals in a field. The ranked list of highly cited journals is a practical tool for a librarian to select the journals of maximum utility. Citation analysis is one of the ways through which one can identify journals most important for the library collection cited by the researchers in their theses.

The present study is based on application of Bradford's law of scattering on the journal citations of theses in social sciences. The concept of core journals is derived from the Bradford's law of scattering.

Review of literature

A number of studies have been conducted to test the applicability of Bradford's law of scattering. The first notable study on the law was conducted by Vickery (1948) who analyzed periodical references¹. Patra and Chand in 2005 used Bradford's law to identify core journals of biotechnology in India². Nicolaisen and Hjorland critically reviewed the application of

Bradford's law³. Hadagali, Kumbar and Benahal⁴ analyzed the citations of Ph.D. theses submitted to the Karnataka University, Dharwad, India in the field of Physics during 1992-2006. They have applied Bradford's law of Scattering on the data and found to be fit in their study. Sudhier⁵ applied the Bradford's law of scattering on physics doctoral theses at the Indian Institute of Science, Bangaluru and found that Bradford's distribution pattern does not fit to the doctoral theses of the IISc. Kumar and Dora⁶ analyzed the doctoral dissertations at IIM, Ahmedabad during the period 2004-2009. The study revealed that journals are the most cited source and the Bradford's law of Scattering was found to be fit to the data. There are many more studies on the application of Bradford's law of Scattering. This paper studies Bradford's law of Scattering on the journal citations of the Ph.D. theses in the field of social sciences, University of Delhi.

Objectives of the study

- 1. To list the distribution of citations by type of documents and year;
- 2. To prepare a ranked list of most cited journals by the Social Sciences researchers;

3. To test the Bradford's Law of scattering.

Methodology

Two-sixty Ph.D. theses of social sciences submitted to the University of Delhi during 1995-2008 were selected as a source of data. A total of 52,378 citations were found in all 260 theses. In the present study, the main focus is on 9,997 journal articles belonging to 934 journals. Each citation was noted down on a data sheet. Citations were categorized based on the form of information sources i.e. books, journals articles, newspapers, reports, conference proceedings, websites, interviews, theses/dissertations etc. MS-Excel was used for data entry and SPSS software for analysis.

Analysis

Document type-wise distribution of citations

Table 1 denotes the distribution of cited literature in different types of documents used by the social sciences researchers.

It is observed from the Table 1 that out of 52,378 citations, books contribute the highest number of citations 29,214 i.e. 55.7%. Journals are the second

highest cited documents accounting for 9997 (19.0%) citations and remaining citations are from newspapers, chapters in book, reports etc.

Country-wise distribution of journal citations

It was found that the 9997 journal citations were from journals published from 31 countries (Table 2).

It is seen from the table that out the total 9997 citations, 5075 (50.7%) citations were from India followed by USA with 2375 (23.8%) citations and UK 1193 (11.9%) citations, The Netherlands with 302 (3.0%) and South Africa with 126 (1.2%) citations. Journals from the other 26 countries have contributed only 926 (9.2%) citations. It indicates more than half of the journals cited by the social sciences researchers are of Indian origin.

Year-wise break-up of journal citations

Table 3 presents the findings of year-wise break-up of journal citations. The duration of the whole period in the present study is divided into 10 year periods beginning from 1900 to 2008.

Table 3 shows that the maximum number of journal citations cited by the researchers is of the period ranging from 1991-2000 that is 2937 (29.4%),

Table 1—Distribution of citations by document type							
Sl. no.	Document types	No. of citations (%)	Cumulative nos. (%)	Rank			
1	Books	29214 (55.7)	29214 (55.7)	1			
2	Journal Articles	9997 (19.0)	39211 (74.8)	2			
3	News Papers	3452 (6.5)	42663 (81.4)	3			
4	Chapters in Book	3262 (6.2)	45925 (87.6)	4			
5	Reports (Annual/Technical)	2397 (4.5)	48322 (92.2)	5			
6	Conference Proceedings	900 (1.7)	49222 (93.9)	6			
7	Magazines	711 (1.3)	49933 (95.3)	7			
8	Web Resources	520 (0.9)	50453 (96.3)	8			
9	Interviews	394 (0.8)	50847 (97.0)	9			
10	Theses/Dissertations	374 (0.7)	51221 (97.7)	10			
11	Government Documents/Records	224 (0.4)	51445 (98.2)	11			
12	Manifestos	208 (0.4)	51653 (98.6)	12			
13	Conversations/Debates	121 (0.2)	51774 (98.8)	13			
14	Gazettes	118 (0.2)	51892 (99.0)	14			
15	Year Books	105 (0.2)	51997 (99.2)	15			
16	Others	381 (0.7)	52378 (100)				
	Total	52, 378					

	,	Table 2—Distribution of citations by country	7	
Sl. no.	Country	No. of citations (%)	Cumulative nos. (%)	Rank
1	India	5075 (50.7)	5075 (50.7)	1
2	USA	2375 (23.8)	7450 (74.5)	2
3	UK	1193 (11.9)	8643 (86.4)	3
4	The Netherlands	302 (3.0)	8945 (89.4)	4
5	South Africa	126 (1.2)	9071 (90.8)	5
6	Others (26 countries)	926 (9.2)	9997 (100)	
	Total	9997		
	Ta	ble 3—Year-wise break-up of journals citation	ons	
Sl. no.	Period of citations	Total no. of citations (%)	Cumulative	nos. (%)
1	Till 1900	20 (0.2)	20 (0	.2)
2	1901-1910	9 (.09)	29 (.2	29)
3	1911-1920	30 (0.3)	59 (.:	59)
4	1921-1930	24 (0.2)	83 (.8	83)
5	1931-1940	99 (0.9)	182 (1	1.9)
6	1941-1950	48 (0.5)	230 (2	2.3)
7	1951-1960	411 (4.1)	641 (6	5.4)
8	1961-1970	788 (7.8)	1429 (14.3)
9	1971-1980	1869 (18.7)	3298 (3	32.9)
10	1981-1990	2883 (28.9)	6181 (6	51.8)
11	1991-2000	2937 (29.4)	9118 (9	91.2)
12	2001-2008	879 (8.8)	9997 (100)
	Total	9997		

followed by the periods 1981-1990 with 2883 (28.9%) citations and from 1971-1980 accounting for 1869 citations (18.7%), 2001-2008 with 879 (8.8%) citations and 1961-1970 with 788 (7.8%) citations. Majority of citations belong to the period 1961-2008.

Ranked list of cited journals in social sciences

Journals are essential for research but because of their increasing cost, librarians study their quality, usefulness, and suitability to a particular group of users. The rank list is a practical tool to select the journals of maximum utility in relation to their coverage of new and important literature in a particular subject area. Ranking of the journals has been prepared on the basis of total citation frequency received by each journal. The titles have been arranged in decreasing order of the number of citations (Table 4).

Table 4 depicts that in all, 9,997 citations were scattered in 934 journals, of which the frequency of

occurrence is least 30 for 55 journals. *Economic & Political Weekly* from India is the most cited journal accounting for 2276 (22.7%) of the total journal citations. *The Punjab Past and Present* follows next with 180 (1.8%) citations, *The Indian Historical Review* with 158 (1.5%) citations, *Indian Economic & Social History Review* with 143 (1.4%) citations and *Indian Journal of Psychiatry* with 133 (1.3%) citations and so on. It is observed that these five top ranked journals cover about 29% of the total citations and all these five journals are from India. The 55 journals contribute about 59% of the total citations and the other 879 journals contribute about 41% of total citations.

Bradford Law of Scattering

Bradford's law of scattering is used to determine the number of core journals in any given field. It states that "journals in a given field can be divided into three zones, containing the same number of articles, a core zone containing the one third of the total

Contd-

Table 4—Ranked list of cited journals in social sciences							
Sl. no.	Journal	Country	No. of Citations (%)	Cumulative Nos. (%)	Rank		
1	Economic & Political Weekly	India	2276 (22.7)	2276 (22.7)	1		
2	The Punjab Past and Present	India	180 (1.8)	2456 (24.5)	2		
3	The Indian Historical Review	India	158 (1.5)	2614 (26.1)	3		
4	Indian Economic & Social History Review	India	143 (1.4)	2757 (27.5)	4		
5	Indian Journal of Psychiatry	India	133 (1.3)	2890 (28.9)	5		
6	Modern Asian Studies	UK	129 (1.2)	3019 (30.2)	6		
7	Social Sciences & Medicine	USA	127 (1.2)	3146 (31.4)	7		
8	Indian Journal of Agricultural Economics	India	124 (1.2)	3270 (32.7)	8		
9	Geographical Review of India	India	123 (1.2)	3393 (33.9)	9		
10	Social Scientist	India	107 (1.0)	3500 (35.0)	10		
11	Anumukti	India	101(1.0)	3601 (36.0)	11		
12	Journal of Asian Studies	UK	99 (0.1)	3700 (37.0)	12		
13	Foreign Affairs	USA	97 (0.9)	3797 (37.9)	13		
14	Indian Journal of Political Science	India	87 (0.8)	3884 (38.8)	14		
15	Contributions to Indian Sociology	India	84 (0.8)	3968 (39.7)	15		
16	American Economic Review	USA	80 (0.8)	4048 (40.5)	16		
17	Social Sciences Probings	India	76 (0.7)	4124 (41.2)	17		
18	Journal of Finance	USA	71 (0.7)	4195 (41.9)	18		
19	Punjab Journal of Politics	India	70 (0.7)	4265 (42.7)	19		
20	Social Work	USA	70 (0.7)	4335 (43.3)	19		
21	Journal of Development Economics	The Netherlands	68 (0.6)	4403 (44.0)	20		
22	Indian Journal of Social Work	India	63 (0.6)	4466 (44.6)	21		
23	Econometrica	The Netherlands	61 (0.6)	4527 (45.2)	22		
24	Man in India	India	60 (0.6)	4587 (45.8)	23		
25	Land Economics	USA	59 (0.5)	4646 (46.4)	24		
26	International Studies	USA	56 (0.5)	4702 (47.0)	25		
27	Journal of Bihar Research Society	India	56 (0.5)	4758 (47.5)	25		
28	Journal of Political Economy	USA	55 (0.5)	4813 (48.1)	26		
29	Indian Historical Quarterly	India	53 (0.5)	4866 (48.6)	27		
30	Africa Quarterly	India	51 (0.5)	4917 (49.1)	28		
31	African Affairs	UK	51 (0.5)	4968 (49.6)	28		
32	Journal of Monetary Economics	The Netherlands	51 (0.5)	5019 (50.2)	28		
33	Administrative Change	India	50 (0.5)	5069 (50.7)	29		
34	Journal of Peasant Studies	UK	49 (0.4)	5118 (51.2)	30		
35	Vikas Varta	India	48 (0.4)	5166 (51.6)	31		
36	Applied Geography	USA	46 (0.4)	5212 (52.1)	32		
37	Management in Government	India	44 (0.4)	5256 (52.5)	33		
38	Subaltern Studies	India	40 (0.4)	5296 (52.9)	34		
					Contd		

Table 4—Ranked list of cited journals in social sciences					
					-Contd
39	American Sociological Review	USA	39 (0.3)	5335 (53.3)	35
40	Third World Quarterly	UK	37 (0.3)	5372 (53.7)	36
41	American Journal of Agricultural Economics	USA	35 (0.3)	5407 (54.0)	37
42	Journal of Marriage and Family	USA	35 (0.3)	5442 (54.4)	37
43	Annals of the National Association of Geographers	India	34 (0.3)	5476 (54.7)	38
44	Indian Culture	India	34 (0.3)	5510 (55.1)	38
45	African Security Review	South Africa	33 (0.3)	5543 (55.4)	39
46	Journal of Studies on Alcohol	USA	33 (0.3)	5576 (55.7)	39
47	Review of African Political Economy	UK	33 (0.3)	5609 (56.1)	39
48	Quarterly Journal of Economics	UK	32 (0.3)	5641 (56.4)	40
49	Journal of National Institute of Environmental Health Science	USA	31 (0.3)	5672 (56.8)	41
50	Pacific Affairs	UK	31 (0.3)	5703 (57.0)	41
51	Population Studies	UK	31 (0.3)	5734 (57.3)	41
52	The Geographer	India	31 (0.3)	5765 (57.6)	41
53	Africa Today	USA	30 (0.3)	5795 (57.9)	42
54	Annals of the Association of American Geographers	USA	30 (0.3)	5825 (58.2)	42
55	Journal of Royal Anthropological Institute	UK	30 (0.3)	5855 (58.6)	42
56	Others (879 Journals)		4142 (41.4)	9997 (100)	
	Total		9,997		

citations, zone 1, containing the same number of articles but a greater number of journals, and zone 2, containing the same number of articles, but still greater number of journals". The mathematical relationship of the number of journals in the core zone to the zone first is a constant *n* and to the second zone the relationship is n^2 . Bradford expressed this relationship as 1: *n*: n^2 .⁷

The number of the journals in each Bradford's zone can be calculated from multiplier constant k that is called Bradford constant. Using the formulation of Egghe $(1986)^8$, Egghe $(1990)^9$, Egghe and Rousseau $(1990)^{10}$, and Andres $(2009)^{11}$ k can be calculated as follow:

$$k = \left(e \times Y_m \right)^{\frac{1}{p}}$$

Where is Euler's number having value .57772

 Y_m is the number of citation of rank one journal

p is Bradford groups or number of zones i.e. p=3

From table 4.110 the number of highest citation is 2276

Hence $Y_m = 2276$

So that

$$k = (2.718^{0.57772} \times 2276)^{\frac{1}{3}}$$

$$k = (1.781 \times 2276)^{\frac{1}{3}}$$

$$k = 15.944$$

Using k we can calculate different Bradford groups. The nucleus zone r_0 can be defined as:

$$r_0 = \frac{T(k-1)}{(k^p - 1)}$$

Where, T represents the total number of journal in this study that is 934.

So
$$r_0 = \frac{934(15.944 - 1)}{(15.944^3 - 1)}$$

Table 5—Distribution of journals								
Rank	No. of Jour.	Cum. No. of Jour.	No. of Citations	Total No. of Citations	Cum. No. of Citations	Log N	% of Citations	% of Total Journals
1	1	1	2276	2276	2276	0.000000000	22.77	0.11
2	1	2	180	180	2456	0.693147181	24.57	0.21
3	1	3	158	158	2614	1.098612289	26.15	0.32
4	1	4	143	143	2757	1.386294361	27.58	0.43
5	1	5	133	133	2890	1.609437912	28.91	0.54
6	1	6	129	129	3019	1.791759469	30.20	0.64
7	1	7	127	127	3146	1.945910149	31.47	0.75
8	1	8	124	124	3270	2.079441542	32.71	0.86
9	1	9	123	123	3393	2.197224577	33.94	0.96
10	1	10	107	107	3500	2.302585093	35.01	1.07
11	1	11	101	101	3601	2.397895273	36.02	1.18
12	1	12	99	99	3700	2.48490665	37.01	1.28
13	1	13	97	97	3797	2.564949357	37.98	1.39
14	1	14	87	87	3884	2.63905733	38.85	1.50
15	1	15	84	84	3968	2.708050201	39.69	1.61
16	1	16	80	80	4048	2.772588722	40.49	1.71
17	1	17	76	76	4124	2.833213344	41.25	1.82
18	1	18	71	71	4195	2.890371758	41.96	1.93
19	2	20	70	140	4335	2.995732274	43.36	2.14
20	1	21	68	68	4403	3.044522438	44.04	2.25
21	1	22	63	63	4466	3.091042453	44.67	2.36
22	1	23	61	61	4527	3.135494216	45.28	2.46
23	1	24	60	60	4587	3.17805383	45.88	2.57
24	1	25	59	59	4646	3.218875825	46.47	2.68
25	2	27	56	112	4758	3.295836866	47.59	2.89
26	1	28	55	55	4813	3.33220451	48.14	3.00
27	1	29	53	53	4866	3.36729583	48.67	3.10
28	3	32	51	153	5019	3.465735903	50.21	3.43
29	1	33	50	50	5069	3.496507561	50.71	3.53
30	1	34	49	49	5118	3.526360525	51.20	3.64
31	1	35	48	48	5166	3.555348061	51.68	3.75
32	1	36	46	46	5212	3.583518938	52.14	3.85
33	1	37	44	44	5256	3.610917913	52.58	3.96
34	1	38	40	40	5296	3.63758616	52.98	4.07
35	1	39	39	39	5335	3.663561646	53.37	4.18
36	1	40	37	37	5372	3.688879454	53.74	4.28
37	2	42	35	70	5442	3.737669618	54.44	4.50
38	2	44	34	68	5510	3.784189634	55.12	4.71
								Contd—

Table 5—Distribution of journals —Contd								
Rank	No. of Jour.	Cum. No. of Jour.	No. of Citations	Total No. of Citations	Cum. No. of Citations	Log N	% of Citations	% of Total Journals
39	3	47	33	99	5609	3.850147602	56.11	5.03
40	1	48	32	32	5641	3.871201011	56.43	5.14
41	4	52	31	124	5765	3.951243719	57.67	5.57
42	5	57	30	150	5915	4.043051268	59.17	6.10
43	5	62	29	145	6060	4.127134385	60.62	6.64
44	1	63	28	28	6088	4.143134726	60.90	6.75
45	4	67	27	108	6196	4.204692619	61.98	7.17
46	2	69	26	52	6248	4.234106505	62.50	7.39
47	4	73	25	100	6348	4.290459441	63.50	7.82
48	4	77	24	96	6444	4.343805422	64.46	8.24
49	5	82	23	115	6559	4.406719247	65.61	8.78
50	3	85	22	66	6625	4.442651256	66.27	9.10
51	3	88	21	63	6688	4.477336814	66.90	9.42
52	11	99	20	220	6908	4.59511985	69.10	10.60
53	5	104	19	95	7003	4.644390899	70.05	11.13
54	4	108	18	72	7075	4.682131227	70.77	11.56
55	2	110	17	34	7109	4.700480366	71.11	11.78
56	10	120	16	160	7269	4.787491743	72.71	12.85
57	5	125	15	75	7344	4.828313737	73.46	13.38
58	10	135	14	140	7484	4.905274778	74.86	14.45
59	10	145	13	130	7614	4.976733742	76.16	15.52
60	12	157	12	144	7758	5.056245805	77.60	16.81
61	14	171	11	154	7912	5.141663557	79.14	18.31
62	20	191	10	200	8112	5.252273428	81.14	20.45
63	12	203	9	108	8220	5.313205979	82.22	21.73
64	14	217	8	112	8332	5.379897354	83.35	23.23
65	22	239	7	154	8486	5.476463552	84.89	25.59
66	23	262	6	138	8624	5.568344504	86.27	28.05
67	37	299	5	185	8809	5.700443573	88.12	32.01
68	84	383	4	336	9145	5.948034989	91.48	41.01
69	90	473	3	270	9415	6.159095388	94.18	50.64
70	121	594	2	242	9657	6.386879319	96.60	63.60
71	340	934	1	340	9997	6.839476438	100.00	100.00

$$r_0 = \frac{934 \times 14.944}{\left(15.944^3 - 1\right)}$$

Different Bradford zone can be obtained using the value of K and $r_{\rm 0}$

Nucleus zone $r_0 = r_0 \times 1 = 3.4446$

 $r_0 = \frac{13957.696}{4052.142} = 3.44$

First zone $r_1 = r_0 \times k = 3.44 \times 15.944 = 54.911$

Table 6—Bradford's group and their number of journals							
Zones	No. of Journals	No. of Citations	k				
Core Zone	04	2757					
Zone 1	55	3098	15.934				
Zone 2	875	4142	15.925				



Fig. 1-Bradford's graph

Second zone

$$r_2 = r_0 \times k^2 = 9.611 \times 15.944^2 = 874.486$$

This theoretical distribution of Bradford's law makes it possible to test the exact fit of Bradford's law to the data in the present study. Using this distribution, the number of citations can be drawn, as shown in the Table 6.

Using the exact number of journals from Table 6 the Bradford's constant *k* is 15.93 and 15.92 for Zone 1 and Zone 2 respectively. That is same to the value of *k* calculated from the formula $_{k} = (e \times Y_{m})^{\downarrow_{p}}$. This shows that in the present study collected data is fit for three zones of Bradford's distribution. In other words, it is 1: *k*: k^{2} which is a proof of Bradford's law.

Further as per the Bradford's law, graph is plotted of the cumulative number of citations with the log of cumulative number of journals. It can be seen clearly from the Fig. 1 that very less numbers of journals are cited highly and maximum numbers of journals are cited very less.

Conclusion

The application of Bradford's law of scattering helps in deriving the list of core journals in a given field. Now in a situation, where information is exponentially growing in the form of books, journals and other documents, cost is also increasing accordingly especially of foreign publications and limited budget of a library does not allowed a librarian to purchase all kind of documents. For this bibliometric methods are playing a crucial role, in which Bradford's law of scattering is one through which a list of core journals can be prepared according to that librarian will select those journals which are found to be greater importance or core journals by applying the Bradford's law on the data. Bradford's law of scattering found to be fit to the present data of study. Hence, the present study, which is based on the journal citations of Ph.D. theses in social sciences submitted to Delhi University, will definitely help the librarian to select the core journals in social sciences by using the list of core journals prepared by the authors by applied Bradford's law of scattering.

Acknowledgements

The authors are thankful to Dr. K.C. Garg, Ex-Chief Scientist, CSIR-NISTADS for his valuable suggestions and comments in improvement of this paper.

References

- 1. Vickery B C, Bradford's law of scattering, *Journal of Documentation*, 4(3) (1948) 198-203.
- Patra S K and Chand P, Biotechnology research profile of India, *Scientometrics*, 63(3) (2005) 583-597. doi: 10.1007/s11192-005-0229-8.
- 3. Nicolaisen J and Hjorland B, Practical potentials of Bradford's law: A critical examination of the reviewed view, *Journal of Documentation*, 63(3) (2007) 359-377. doi: 10.1108/00220410710743298.
- Hadagali Gururaj S, Kumbar B D and Benahal Amrut, Citation analysis of Ph.D. theses submitted to Karnatak University, Dharwad in the field of physics, *Information Studies*, 15(2) (2009) 115-127.
- 5. Sudhier K G Pillai, Application of Bradford's law of scattering to the physics literature: A study of doctoral theses

citations at the Indian institute of science, *DESIDOC Journal* of Library & Information Technology, 30(2) (2010) 3-14.

- Kumar A H and Dora M, Citation analysis of doctoral dissertations at IIMA: A review of the local use of journals, *Library Collections, Acquisitions, and Technical Services*, 35(1) (2011) 32-39.
- 7. Patra S K and Chand P, Library and Information Science Research in India: A bibliometrcic study, *Annals of Library and Information Studies*, 53 (2006) 221.
- Egghe L, On the 80/20 rule, *Scientometrics*, 10(1-2) (1986) 55-68. doi: 10.1007/BF02016860. (Accessed on Feb 11, 2013)
- Egghe L, A note on different Bradford multipliers, *Journal of the American Society for Information Science and Technology*, 41(3) (1990) 204-209. doi: 10.1002/(SICI)1097-4571(199004)41:3<204::AID-ASI7>3.0.CO;2-8. (Accessed on July 2, 2012)
- 10. Egghe L and Rousseau R, Introduction to Informetrics: quantitative methods in library, documentation and information science. Elsevier, Amsterdam, 1990. Retrieved through http://eprints.rclis.org/6011/.
- 11. Andres A, Measuring academic research: how to undertake a bibliometric study. Chandos Publishing, Oxford, 2009.